# **UNIVERSIDAD SAN FRANCISCO DE QUITO USFQ**

**Colegio de Ciencias e Ingenierías**

**Systematic Literature Review about Polyvinyl Alcohol as a Biomaterial, in Combination with Natural Polysaccharides in Tissue Engineering Applications** .

# **Doménica Camila Almeida Gaibor**

# **Ingeniería Química**

Trabajo de fin de carrera presentado como requisito para la obtención del título de Ingeniera Química

Quito, 29 de noviembre de 2020

# **UNIVERSIDAD SAN FRANCISCO DE QUITO USFQ**

# **Colegio de Ciencias e Ingenierías**

# **HOJA DE CALIFICACIÓN DE TRABAJO DE FIN DE CARRERA**

**Systematic Literature Review about Polyvinyl Alcohol as a Biomaterial, in Combination with Natural Polysaccharides in Tissue Engineering Applications**

# **Doménica Camila Almeida Gaibor**

**Nombre del profesor, Título académico Daniela Almeida, Dr.-Ing.**

 **José Álvarez, PhD.**

Quito, 29 de noviembre de 2020

# **© DERECHOS DE AUTOR**

Por medio del presente documento certifico que he leído todas las Políticas y Manuales de la Universidad San Francisco de Quito USFQ, incluyendo la Política de Propiedad Intelectual USFQ, y estoy de acuerdo con su contenido, por lo que los derechos de propiedad intelectual del presente trabajo quedan sujetos a lo dispuesto en esas Políticas.

Asimismo, autorizo a la USFQ para que realice la digitalización y publicación de este trabajo en el repositorio virtual, de conformidad a lo dispuesto en la Ley Orgánica de Educación Superior del Ecuador.



# **ACLARACIÓN PARA PUBLICACIÓN**

**Nota:** El presente trabajo, en su totalidad o cualquiera de sus partes, no debe ser considerado como una publicación, incluso a pesar de estar disponible sin restricciones a través de un repositorio institucional. Esta declaración se alinea con las prácticas y recomendaciones presentadas por el Committee on Publication Ethics COPE descritas por Barbour et al. (2017) Discussion document on best practice for issues around theses publishing, disponible en http://bit.ly/COPETheses.

# **UNPUBLISHED DOCUMENT**

**Note:** The following capstone project is available through Universidad San Francisco de Quito USFQ institutional repository. Nonetheless, this project – in whole or in part – should not be considered a publication. This statement follows the recommendations presented by the Committee on Publication Ethics COPE described by Barbour et al. (2017) Discussion document on best practice for issues around theses publishing available on http://bit.ly/COPETheses.

#### **RESUMEN**

La presente revisión sistemática de literatura tiene como objetivo elaborar un análisis comparativo de estudios relacionados con las aplicaciones del alcohol polivinílico (PVA), en combinación con polisacáridos, en el campo de la ingeniería de tejidos, a través de diferentes parámetros de interés. Se realizó una investigación utilizando PubMed y Scopus como bases de datos para encontrar publicaciones entre 2010 y 2020. Teniendo en cuenta ciertos criterios de inclusión, por ejemplo, los parámetros que afectan las características del PVA como su grado de hidrólisis y su concentración inicial, se obtuvo un total de setenta y nueve publicaciones que incluyen revisiones y artículos de investigación originales de revistas indexadas. Los parámetros tomados para el análisis comparativo incluyeron el grado de hidrólisis de PVA, la concentración inicial de PVA, el tipo de polisacárido, el tipo de tejido diseñado y las pruebas biológicas realizadas. Se encontró que se prefieren grados de hidrólisis más altos, así como concentraciones bajas de PVA. Además, el polisacárido más utilizado es el quitosano, mientras que los tejidos relacionados con la piel son el foco principal en los tejidos manipulados y las pruebas *in vitro* se realizan con mayor frecuencia. Sin embargo, todavía hay aspectos que podrían mejorarse en algunos estudios, como incluir información importante, como el grado de hidrólisis del PVA, que en ocasiones no se menciona. Los materiales de PVA-polisacáridos tienen un gran potencial para aplicaciones de ingeniería de tejidos, pero se necesitan más estudios in vivo para asegurar una comercialización viable.

**Palabras clave:** Alcohol polivinílico (PVA), ingeniería de tejidos, polisacáridos, pruebas *in vitro* e *in vivo*

### **ABSTRACT**

The present systematic literature review aims to elaborate a comparative analysis of studies related to applications of polyvinyl alcohol (PVA), in combination with polysaccharides, in the field of tissue engineering, through different parameters of interest. A research was done using PubMed and Scopus as databases to find publications between 2010 and 2020. Taking certain inclusion criteria, such as parameters that affect PVA characteristics like PVA hydrolysis degree and initial concentration, into account led to a total of seventy-nine publications including reviews and original research articles from indexed journals. The parameters taken into for the comparative analysis included PVA hydrolysis degree, PVA initial concentration, type of polysaccharide, type of tissue engineered, and biological tests done. It was found that higher hydrolysis degrees are preferred as well as low PVA concentrations. Also, the most used polysaccharide is chitosan, while skin related tissues are the main focus in tissue engineered, and *in vitro* most widely carried out. However, there are still aspects that could be improved in some studies, like including important information, such as PVA hydrolysis degree, which is sometimes not mentioned. PVA-polysaccharide materials have great potential for tissue engineering applications, but greater *in vivo* studies are needed to assure feasible commercialization.

**Key words:** Polyvinyl alcohol (PVA), tissue engineering, polysaccharides, *in vitro* and *in vivo*  tests.

# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**



## **INDEX OF FIGURES**



#### **1. INTRODUCTION**

Tissue engineering consists in the development of constructs based on biomaterial scaffolds, cells and molecules in order to restore, maintain or improve tissue functions in a damaged area of the body  $\frac{1}{1}$ . Some examples of tissues that could be recovered with this technology include bone, cartilages, and skin  $2$ . The principle of this field consists in the construction of scaffolds from different biomaterials, such as proteins and biopolymers. Cells are then seeded into the scaffolds to be implanted, and develop viable tissues *in vivo* <sup>3</sup> .

As mentioned previously, scaffolds represent one of the key components in tissue engineering constructs. Therefore, most research has been carried out on different biopolymeric systems for this purpose. Some examples of biopolymers that could be use are polyesters, polyanhydrides, polyphosphazenes, polyurethane, poly (glycerol sebacate) 4 and polyvinyl alcohol (PVA), which will be analyzed in this study. PVA, a synthetic material, is one of the most widely used biopolymers due to its good biocompatibility, biodegradability and hydrophilicity features that make it suitable for different biomedical applications. This biopolymer has been particularly useful in the creation of hydrogels <sup>5</sup>.

PVA has different properties that affect its possible uses, such as the presence of crosslinking hydrogen bonds, which promotes the gelation and hydrogel network formation. Furthermore, PVA hydrogels have enhanced pH sensitivity, swelling activity and water vapor transmission, important characteristics for materials in wounds healing <sup>6</sup>. However, hydrogels based on PVA only present some important limitations. High concentrations of the polymer are needed to achieve stable structures with appropriate mechanical properties, making their mass application technically and economically unfeasible, since solutions at these concentrations are extremely viscous, and pharmaceutical grade PVA is expensive  $\frac{7}{1}$ . That is why other materials are combined with PVA to improve hydrogels properties, providing, at the same time, the possibility to create other structures of importance, such as nanofibers, nanoparticles, and sponges, among others <sup>8</sup>. To achieve this goal, a great deal of research has been focused on polysaccharides.

Natural polysaccharides are one of the most relevant macromolecules in nature, with important functional diversity that make them promising materials for different biomedical applications, including tissue engineering and drug delivery <sup>9</sup>. Particularly, cellulose, chitosan, hyaluronic acid and alginate are found to be extensively studied for applications in biomedicine <sup>10</sup>. However, they also have some drawbacks, such as poor mechanical properties, high moisture absorption, low stability in aqueous and physiological environments, among others <sup>9</sup>. This could be partially overcome with crosslinking agents, but these are often cytotoxic  $11$ . Consequently, PVA and polysaccharides can be combined to potentiate their characteristics of interest and mitigate some of their limitations.

As there is a large body or research reporting the development and application of PVA/polysaccharide structures, there is a need to compile relevant findings. A systemic literature review would not only gather and systematize all the information but would also help in identifying research niches that need to be addressed. Consequently, the present work aims to make a comparative analysis of the scientific literature on the combination of PVA and polysaccharides, according to different parameters, such as PVA hydrolysis degree, polysaccharides used, tissues engineered, and biological tests.

#### **2. METHODOLOGY**

Indexed literature was searched in PubMed and Scopus as online databases, using a year range from 2010 to 2020. The search terms used were "polysaccharide", "tissue engineering" and "polyvinyl alcohol" as visualized in Figure 1, where different Boolean terms were used for joining these general terminologies and reach a proper amount of publications to work. Consequently, inclusion criteria refer to parameters that affect the global search terms. Some examples are PVA hydrolysis degree that could alter PVA characteristics, type of polysaccharide used, and biological tests done to determine the efficiency of the scaffolds developed, among others.

On the other hand, studies that include polyvinyl alcohol and polysaccharides in other type of fields like drug delivery, and ones that do not have enough information to carry out a comparative analysis were not considered. Subsequently, an initial recognition of publications was done where titles and abstracts were evaluated to qualify their entire content. The types of documents that were considered include articles from indexed research journals as well as literature reviews of the topics covered. The articles found were used for doing statistics about the different aspects mentioned in the inclusion criteria taken into account.



Figure 1. Searching terms use for the digital research from the global terms to a more specific one with the amount of results obtained in each case

#### **3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS**

As mentioned previously, this work seeks to elaborate a comparative analysis of different parameters that affect the studies around PVA as a biomaterial, in combination with naturally derived polysaccharides, for tissue engineering applications. For that matter, a total of seventy-nine publications were found, including eight reviews and seventy-one articles from indexed research journals. The aspects that were analyzed include PVA hydrolysis degree, PVA initial concentration, type of structure generated, the polysaccharides combined with PVA, different encapsulated agents, bioactive additives, tissues engineered, and biological tests done. A comprehensive summary of these aspects is provided in Annex 1, at the end of this document. The number of articles that were published in the time laps considered is visualized in Figure 2, showing that in recent years more studies have been done reaching a peak in 2019.



Figure 2. Amount of articles published per year from 2010 to 2020

## **3.1. PVA in tissue engineering**

#### **3.1.1. PVA hydrolysis degree.**

PVA is prepared by the hydrolysis of poly (vinyl acetate); therefore, its characteristics depend on the degree of polymerization and on the degree of hydrolysis, which defines the fraction of hydroxyl groups that are present on the backbone 12. PVA hydrolysis degree (HD) can affect the nature of the interactions between polymer chains, as well as between the polymer and small additive molecules, such as plasticizers. There are various parameters that could be affected by PVA HD; two of them are the glass transition temperature (Tg), and the cavity radio 12. Moreover, changes in these parameters allow to detect variations in the fabrication, sterilization and storage of scaffolds in tissue engineering 13.

Furthermore, in most cases high degrees of hydrolysis are used in multiple studies, in this case a 41.25%<sup>14–52</sup> of publications analyzed use a DH form 96% to 100%, and, on the other hand, a 1.25% of the cases use lower hydrolysis degrees from 80% to 83% <sup>53</sup>. However, there is a large number of publications that do not include the hydrolysis degree of the PVA use, which in this case represents 31.25% of the cases 5,15,20,24,25,31,44,54–70.

## **3.1.2. PVA concentration.**

The concentration of PVA directly influences in the construction of scaffolds and their properties. In the study of Yung-Chuan et al, 2005, the fabrication of biocompatible nanocomposites that replicate the properties of cardiovascular tissue was analyzed. In this study, various percentages of PVA were used, from 7.5 to 15%, in combination with bacterial cellulose. In this case, a parameter that could be affected by the variation on concentration is the elastic modulus, which was dependent on the PVA amount in the composite. Furthermore, as the percentage of PVA was higher, the increase of the modulus was faster  $71$ . In the literature, concentration of PVA is presented in different units like weight percentage 12,14,45,48,49,53,57,60,66– 69,17,72,18,20,23,32,34,35,38 and volume percentage 22,24,46,50,54,70,73–76,26,27,30,31,36,40–42, but in general it is mostly used in low concentrations.

#### **3.2. Structures and fabrication methods**

### **3.2.1. Hydrogels.**

As previously mentioned, PVA is one of the most widely used biopolymers for scaffold fabrication; however, the main type of scaffolding structure synthetized from it are hydrogels, water-swollen crosslinked polymer networks that present characteristics such as tissue-like elasticity and mechanical strength<sup>5</sup>. PVA hydrogels can be synthetized using the freeze-thaw method, suitable for biomedical and pharmaceutical applications, where the main parameters include temperature of freezing, time and number of freezing cycles. This method, compared to others, has the advantage that the use of a crosslinking agent is avoided, which could reduce inflammatory responses 77.

On the other hand, in order to obtain a greater variety of hydrogel structures, PVA can be crosslinked with polysaccharides. Through this combination nanoparticles, nanofibers, sponges, nanotubes, microspheres and also hydrogels can be generated. Each structure has its own characteristics; for instance, hydrogels are used to direct cell behavior such as migration, adhesion, differentiation and proliferation <sup>69</sup>. In addition, in the case of these hydrogels the most used synthesis methods are freeze–thaw, and dissolvable-network-based sacrificial molding <sup>78</sup>. Hydrogels represent the structures used to greatest extent, with over 36.9% of the publications taken into account 5,15,21,23,24,26,28,29,31,33,48,50–52,55–58,61,68–70,76,79–83.

Once fabricated, they are tested in different mechanical parameters, such as tensile strength, elongation at break and compressive strength <sup>69</sup>. In addition, they have characteristics of high-water content and porous structure, which can simulate the extracellular matrix of human tissues and promote the exchange of nutrients and metabolic waste <sup>81</sup>. Also, natural polymer-based hydrogels such as collagen, cellulose, chitin, and chitosan show good cell signal transduction and cell-induction characteristics, promising for tissue regeneration. In addition, these natural polymers, once crosslinked with PVA, present appropriate mechanical properties and biocompatibility 69.

### **3.2.2. Nanoparticles.**

In the case of nanoparticles, they are used as encapsulating agents in the fabrication of larger scaffolds, representing 14.3% of the published studies 31,32,36,40,44,45,51,53,54,68,73,76,84. The

nanoparticles used could be of different sources such as curcumin  $54$ , zinc oxide  $31$ , silver  $51$ , carbonated hydroxyapatite 40, *Cissus quadrangularis* extract 44, and lignin 45, among others. The types of scaffolds that could be developed using nanoparticles are mainly hydrogels, nanofibers and other nanocomposites 31,32,40,51,68,76. Moreover, there are different methods used for nanoparticles synthesis, such as co precipitation method  $40$ , and double emulsion-solvent evaporation technique  $^{73}$ , among others. Furthermore, nanoparticles have multiple properties like increased permeability, larger surface for protein binding and enhanced scaffold bioactivity 44, which make them good candidates in the field of tissue engineering.

## **3.2.3. Nanofibers.**

Other structures highly used, with approximately 36% of the studies taken into account are nanofibers because of their great potential to mimic natural extracellular matrix in terms of structure, porosity and chemical composition 12,14,30,32,34–36,38–40,42,46,16,49,53,60,62– 64,70,72,74,79,17,81,85–88,18–20,22,25,27. Nanofibrous matrices could show proper elongation and high porosity, while maintaining mechanical stiffness and gradual degradation simultaneously, which are specifications for muscle cell culture  $81$ . These scaffolds, in addition to mimicking the natural extracellular matrix, can stimulate cell adhesion, proliferation, migration, and differentiation better than particulate structures  $74$ . The most common method for the preparation of nanofibrous is the electrospinning technique, which consists in obtaining fibers by spinning solutions of polymer though a high electric field to overcome its surface tension forces, and then, fine fibers get expelled from the capillary of the equipment <sup>89</sup>. This technique is highly used for its flexibility in the elaboration of micro and nanosized fibers with unique characteristics 86.

### **3.2.4. Other structures.**

There are other types of structures that are less frequently used, such as cryogels and nanotubes. Cryogels are porous scaffolds usually prepared using chemical crosslinking

methods with agents, such as glutaraldehyde, and its properties depend on the type of PVA used and its initial concentration <sup>47</sup>. Another less conventional structure are nanotubes, and, in this case, the fabrication method is mainly focused on improvement of nanotube dispersion in a PVA matrix and on the enhancement of interfacial interactions <sup>90</sup>. Both of these structures need to be studied more extensively in order to assess their real potential for these applications.

## **3.3. Polysaccharides used in combination with PVA**

## **3.3.1. Chitosan.**

The most common polysaccharide used with PVA is chitosan, with a 64.4% of the cases analyzed 12,15,35–41,43–45,16,48–56,62,17,63,64,66,67,69,70,73,74,78,79,18,80–83,88–90,19,20,27,30,34. Chitosan is a biocompatible, biodegradable and non-toxic polysaccharide that can be used safely inside or outside the body 54. It has been used in many biomedical applications such as tissue engineering, wound dressings, and drug delivery systems <sup>79</sup>. Thus, it is widely used in burn wound management. Soft membranes of low molecular weight chitosan with PVA have been studied for antibacterial and wound healing properties, showing significant antibacterial activity towards different pathogens 16.

Furthermore, chitosan´s most promising feature is its ability to be processed into porous structures in cell transplantation and tissue regeneration 56. This polysaccharide, along with PVA could be used in different scenarios; for example, their scaffolds present enhanced viability and proliferation of nerve cells, which increases the biocompatibility 35. In addition, chitosan has structural similarities to some extracellular matrix components; therefore, it helps in improving its efficacy in skin tissue engineering <sup>62</sup>. Moreover, chitosan and PVA polymeric blend´s synergic effects have shown important contributions on their physico-chemical properties. Thus, the polymer concentration and miscibility are two of the most important parameters to obtain satisfactory synergistic effects 41.

Different agents have been encapsulated into the PVA-polysaccharide structures to enhance their bioactivity. An example of this is *C. quadrangularis* extract, which has several bioactive compounds that enhance collagen production and have a positive effect on bone fracture healing 44. Curcumin, on the other hand, is used for being anticarcinogenic, antiinflammatory, antioxidant, anti-coagulant, antimutagenic, and anti-infective. In addition it has good wound healing potential and enhances the granulation tissue formation, collagen deposition, remodeling of tissues and contraction of wounds 70.

#### **3.3.2. Alginate.**

Sodium alginate (SA) consists in a linear polysaccharide with high hydrophilicity, biodegradability, biocompatibility, protein adsorption ability and a relatively economical use <sup>80</sup>. It is one of the most popular polysaccharides in different applications, with over 12.3% of the ones reported in this review 21–24,46,57,76,80,82 . For its combination with PVA in hydrogels, alginates provide physical and biological properties for modeling wound dressing 80. In addition, sodium alginate raises the water-vapor transmission rate, springiness and permeability, but decreases the gel fraction and flexibility of wound bandages  $2^1$ . This polysaccharide could also be used as nanofibers, but its capacity to be electrospun is low due to expansion of the alginate chains in water. Nonetheless, this could be achieved if the electrospinning takes place in organic solvents and in aqueous solutions with synthetic water‐ soluble polymers such as PVA 86.

An encapsulated agent incorporated in PVA-alginate matrices is honey, a natural wound-healing agent that is used in modern clinical wound care as it has antibacterial, antiinflammatory, and antioxidant properties. Nanofibrous membranes with honey showed enhanced antioxidant activity, which could provide the ability to control the overproduction of reactive oxygen species  $(ROS)$  <sup>22</sup>. On the other hand, a bioactive additive used is hydroxyapatite which incorporated with PVA is able to increase the biocompatibility and osteoconductivity of the scaffolds  $24$ . With these agents it could be improve the scaffolds use with this type of polysaccharide and increase the amount of properties.

### **3.3.3. Starch.**

Starch has various advantages, such as being biocompatible, biodegradable, non-toxic and highly abundant, characteristics that make it an appropriate candidate for biomedical applications like wound dressing  $30$ . In addition, starch is affordable and feasible for the fabrication of synthetic polymer-based composite materials and bio composites because of its easy production from sustainable natural biological resources such as corn, potato, wheat and rice <sup>28</sup>. Nevertheless, native starch does not have adequate mechanical strength to serve as a wound dressing material and can be thereby modified and combined with PVA to mitigate these limitations. Thus, PVA-starch blended films for wound dressing applications possess good degradation, strength, flexibility and water resistance <sup>29</sup>. This polysaccharide is used in 10.96% of the cases taken into account for the statistics 25,26,28,29,31,32,47,88.

In this case an encapsulated agent that has been used is vitamin E, which has shown effective skin care and regeneration functions due to its strong antioxidant activity, antiinflammatory response, scar prevention properties and availability. Vitamin E was used as nanoparticles, and together with starch and PVA has a good potential for treating skin wounds  $32$ . Other additives include glycerol with citric acid; they provide better molecular interactions and synergy, which promote the flexibility, plasticity, physicochemical and mechanical properties of PVA-starch films. In addition, citric acid, in appropriate proportions, does not prevent cell growth, and also enhances the antibacterial properties of the wound dressing film, promoting, at the same time, the development of new tissues at the wound site 28.

#### **3.3.4. Cellulose.**

This polysaccharide is used in different forms such as bacterial cellulose, nanocellulose, and microcrystalline structure, with important characteristics for biomedical engineering, such

as polyfunctionality, hydrophilicity, and biocompatibility  $7<sup>1</sup>$ . For instance, nanocellulose used in combination with PVA exhibits collagen-like mechanical behavior, which is typical of soft tissues. Thus, as a hydrogel, PVA-cellulose blends are good contenders for contact lens and other ocular applications 68. In the case of this polysaccharide, 4.1% of the publications analyzed used it in their studies 58,60,68 .

A crosslinking agent that could be used with cellulose is borax. PVA with borax networks provide a better interaction with the surrounding polymer phase forming hydrogen bonds obtained from the extensive hydroxyl groups. In addition, PVA with borax gels presents well-defined and loose porous networks 58.

#### **3.3.5. Other polysaccharides**.

There are other types of polysaccharides that could be used in combination with PVA in tissue engineering but have been less explored. One example is carrageenan, which, in combination with PVA, achieved good hemocompatibility and did not generate adverse inflammatory response 61. Another example is lignin, which crosslinked with PVA contributed to remarkable improvements in tensile strength and modulus <sup>45</sup>. Other polysaccharide less frequently used is chitin that together with chitosan and PVA are appropriate for the design of biomaterials, such as biodegradable films 87.

### **3.4. Tissues engineered with PVA-based structures**

## **3.4.1. Skin.**

In the case of skin, different types of scaffolds could be used, such as hydrogels 21,26,28,29,31,41,50,51,55,69,70,76,79,80, nanofibers 18,22,25,30,32,38,46,62–64,70,74,79 and nanoparticles 31,32,51,54,76,84. These structures are applied in the area of wound healing, which remains the most successful case of tissue engineering, as studied in 43.9% of the cases analyzed 16,18,32,38,41,46,50,51,54,55,62,63,21,64,69,70,74,75,77,80,81,83,22,25,26,28–31. For instance, chitosan and PVA nanofibers are used for skin regeneration, although they present low mechanical properties and loose of integrity in aqueous media that limit their application. Thus, physical and chemical crosslinking methods are used to improve that inconvenience 79.

Open wounds increase the exposure to oxygen that will generate more reactive oxygen species (ROS), which leads to produce more oxidative stress, causing inhibition of optimum wound healing <sup>70</sup>. Therefore, in the cases that present more damage due to ROS, it is useful to apply PVA structures/scaffolds that have a great affinity for skin and extracellular matrix materials 91. There have been progresses in this field, with the combination of proper polysaccharides, such as chitosan, that is useful because of its structural similarity to glycosaminoglycans, providing high density matrix and absence of inflamed cells 54.

### **3.4.2. Bone.**

Another highly studied tissue, with 27.3% of the publications taken into account is bone 24,37,69,71,78,82–84,88,89,39,40,43,44,48,60,66,67. In this case, chitosan is combined with PVA to generate scaffolds because of their cytocompatibility and enhancement of osteoblastic cell proliferation  $72$ . Moreover, PVA is also used with hydroxyethyl cellulose for the elaboration of nanofibers coated with bone like apatite, which result in a suitable biomaterial for bone engineering <sup>60</sup>. Furthermore, cellulose nanofibers together with hydroxyapatite nanoparticles can be incorporated into starch/PVA matrix crosslinked with citric acid in order to develop a scaffold that is biocompatible, bioactive and that could properly mimic bone extracellular matrix <sup>88</sup>.

### **3.4.3. Cartilage.**

Cartilage is another type of tissue that could be engineered; 10.6% of the studies focused on different types of cartilage, such as craniofacial 82 or articular 36,40,49,56,61,76,83. PVA can be used as hydrogels which show high mechanical properties and biological safety that is why they are used as articular cartilage scaffolds, but cell adhesion on this material is poor <sup>61</sup>. On the other hand, natural polysaccharides, such as chitosan  $36,49,56$ , alginate  $82$  and carrageenan  $61$ , are able to provide appropriate micro-environments that will modulate the cell attachment and proliferation, which make their combination a good candidate for a development of artificial grafts 61.

### **3.4.4. Other tissues.**

There are other tissues that can be engineered with the use of PVA-polysaccharide biomaterials, but not enough studies of them have been carried out. Ocular tissue could be engineered using hydrogels, with the unique properties of PVA in combination with nanocellulose <sup>68</sup>. Other type with 4.5% of studies is neural tissue, in which porous nanofiber composites have shown great potential in mimicking nerve extracellular matrix in terms of structure, porosity, and chemical composition 14,35,53. In addition, these nanofibers in combination with PVA, carbon nanotubes and chitosan can provide the needed structural reinforcement for neural tissue scaffolding due to their high aspect ratio, porosity, high structural and chemical stability  $53$ . For 1.5% of the publications, cardiovascular tissue is engineered, which used conductive scaffolds because of their similarity to the extracellular matrix of this type of tissue. In this case, electrospun nanofiber scaffolds based on PVA, chitosan, and carbon nanotube were used 19.

#### **3.5. Biological tests**

#### **3.5.1.** *In vitro* **tests.**

In order to prove the viability of PVA structures for the regeneration of tissues of interest, *in vitro* and *in vivo* tests in different animal models are performed. Most of the studies, 54.9%, only do *in vitro* tests that are less expensive and a better first approach 12,17,30,32,34–37,39– 42,18,43,44,46–49,53,55,57,60,19,61,63,66,67,74,77,79,84,88,20,22,25,26,28,29. *In vitro* tests could evaluate different parameters such as cell proliferation, biomineralization, biodegradability, cytocompatibility, cytotoxicity, among others 48. For instance, cytocompatibility is confirmed by the culturing of the desired type of cell, such as mesenchymal stem cells  $^{19}$ , dermal fibroblastic cells  $^{38}$  and nasoseptal cells  $82$ , in the correspondent PVA-polysaccharide scaffold  $75$ . Moreover, the cytotoxicity of the scaffolds could be tested using the MTT (3-(4,5-dimethylthiazol-2-yl)-2,5 diphenyltetrazolium bromide) assay on the cells cultured 22.

#### **3.5.2.** *In vivo* **tests.**

For a smaller amount, 3.9%, of the studies, only *in vivo* tests are done, where mainly rabbits and rats, such as Wistar and Sprague-Dawley strains, were used to assay the different types of PVA-polysaccharide scaffolds 21,23,50,52,64,89. In these scenarios, scaffold biocompatibility was evaluated using the artificial grafts inside the animal; in this way, it could also be evaluated their viability, adhesion, growth and spread  $81$ . Additionally, wound healing effects and histopathology of the studied structures could be compared to commercial products 21.

#### **3.5.3. Both type of tests.**

In some studies, which represent a 17.9% of the publications taken into account, it could apply both types of tests, *in vitro* and *in vivo*, in order to obtain more relevant results 15,31,75,76,80,81,38,51,54,56,62,69,70,73. For instance, the study of Bi et al, 2019, included an *in vitro* test to determine the biocompatibility of the PVA-Chitosan hydrogels synthetized and an *in vivo* test was used in order to reveal that the surface mineralized double network hydrogel accelerated simultaneous regeneration of bone defects using a rabbit bone model <sup>69</sup>. Another example could be found in the work of Prabhjot et al, 2019, where the *in vitro* test was used to determine the self-adherent, antibacterial and biocompatible of the PVA – Sodium Alginate membrane developed and in the *in vivo* test was found a significant bacterial reduction, wound contraction and reduced inflammation in membrane treated groups in comparison to control group 80.

#### **4. CONCLUSIONS**

There is plenty of literature available about the use of PVA in combination with polysaccharides in tissue engineering applications but not enough studies that recompile this kind of information. Thus, this systematic literature review is useful for this matter and could also promote a deeper study in aspects that are not correctly attended. However, for this field of study to advance, there are certain aspects that should be tackled. In some publications certain parameters are not reported, such as PVA hydrolysis degree, which is useful to understand PVA behavior and comprehend better the results. Therefore, this kind of information should be included in the all studies performed. Also, there are important opportunities for further research that are revealed from the present analysis, particularly in the applications on tissues different from skin, bone and cartilage.

Moreover, in several studies, *in vitro* tests are used as results of scaffold biocompatibility, when it should be limited to cytocompatibility or hemocompatibility. To assure biocompatibility, an *in vivo* assessment is required, and it is important to clarify this misunderstanding to establish important consensual conclusions about PVA-polysaccharide biomaterials performance. *In vivo* studies are expensive and complex, but for these biomaterials to be translated from bench to the clinic, they are crucial, and more of them are needed if PVA-polysaccharide structures are to succeed commercially.

#### **REFERENCES**

- 1. Berthiaume, F., Maguire, T. J. & Yarmush, M. L. Tissue Engineering and Regenerative Medicine: History, Progress, and Challenges. *Annu. Rev. Chem. Biomol. Eng.* **2**, 403–430 (2011).
- 2. Langer, R. & Vacanti, J. Advances in tissue engineering. *J. Pediatr. Surg.* **51**, 8–12 (2016).
- 3. Harrison, R. H., St-Pierre, J. P. & Stevens, M. M. Tissue engineering and regenerative medicine: A year in review. *Tissue Eng. - Part B Rev.* **20**, 1–16 (2014).
- 4. Guo, B. & Ma, P. X. Synthetic biodegradable functional polymers for tissue engineering: A brief review. *Sci. China Chem.* **57**, 490–500 (2014).
- 5. Jiang, S., Liu, S. & Feng, W. PVA hydrogel properties for biomedical application. *J. Mech. Behav. Biomed. Mater.* **4**, 1228–1233 (2011).
- 6. Kim, S., Lim, H., Kim, S. & Lee, D. Y. Effect of PVA Concentration on Strength and Cell Growth Behavior of PVA / gelatin Hydrogels for Wound Dressing Effect of PVA Concentration on Strength and Cell Growth Behavior of PVA / gelatin Hydrogels for Wound Dressing. **7**, 1–7 (2020).
- 7. Pham, D. Van & Tho Bach, L. Immobilized bacteria by using PVA (Polyvinyl alcohol) crosslinked with Sodium sulfate. *Int. J. Sci. Eng.* **7**, 41–47 (2014).
- 8. Kamoun, E. A., Kenawy, E. R. S. & Chen, X. A review on polymeric hydrogel membranes for wound dressing applications: PVA-based hydrogel dressings. *J. Adv. Res.* **8**, 217–233 (2017).
- 9. Vandghanooni, S. & Eskandani, M. Electrically conductive biomaterials based on natural polysaccharides: Challenges and applications in tissue engineering. *Int. J. Biol. Macromol.* **141**, 636–662 (2019).
- 10. Tchobanian, A., Van Oosterwyck, H. & Fardim, P. Polysaccharides for tissue engineering: Current landscape and future prospects. *Carbohydr. Polym.* **205**, 601–625 (2019).
- 11. Wachem, M. J. A. V. L. P. B. Van, Damink, L. O. & Feijen, P. J. D. J. Crosslinked Dermal Sheep Collagens. **26**, 1091–1110 (1992).
- 12. Fong, R. J., Robertson, A., Mallon, P. E. & Thompson, R. L. The impact of plasticizer and degree of hydrolysis on free volume of poly(vinyl alcohol) films. *Polymers (Basel).* **10**, 1–15 (2018).
- 13. Catalan, K. N., Corrales, T. P., Forero, J. C., Romero, C. P. & Acevedo, C. A. Glass transition in crosslinked nanocomposite scaffolds of Gelatin/chitosan/hydroxyapatite. *Polymers (Basel).* **11**, 1–7 (2019).
- 14. Ghasemi Hamidabadi, H. *et al.* Chitosan-Intercalated Montmorillonite/Poly(vinyl alcohol) Nanofibers as a Platform to Guide Neuronlike Differentiation of Human Dental Pulp Stem Cells. *ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces* **9**, 11392–11404 (2017).
- 15. Bi, S. *et al.* The toughness chitosan-PVA double network hydrogel based on alkali solution system and hydrogen bonding for tissue engineering applications. *Int. J. Biol. Macromol.* **146**, 99–109 (2020).
- 16. Bano, I., Arshad, M., Yasin, T. & Ghauri, M. A. Preparation, characterization and evaluation of glycerol plasticized chitosan/PVA blends for burn wounds. *Int. J. Biol. Macromol.* **124**, 155–162 (2019).
- 17. Koosha, M. & Mirzadeh, H. Electrospinning, mechanical properties, and cell behavior study of chitosan/PVA nanofibers. *J. Biomed. Mater. Res. - Part A* **103**, 3081–3093 (2015).
- 18. Zou, F. *et al.* Mechanical enhancement and in vitro biocompatibility of nanofibrous collagen-chitosan scaffolds for tissue engineering. *J. Biomater. Sci. Polym. Ed.* **28**,

2255–2270 (2017).

- 19. Mombini, S. *et al.* Chitosan-PVA-CNT nanofibers as electrically conductive scaffolds for cardiovascular tissue engineering. *Int. J. Biol. Macromol.* **140**, 278–287 (2019).
- 20. Pandele, A. M. *et al.* Synthesis, characterization, and in vitro studies of graphene oxide/chitosan-polyvinyl alcohol films. *Carbohydr. Polym.* **102**, 813–820 (2014).
- 21. Choi, Y. K. *et al.* Amniotic membrane extract-loaded double-layered wound dressing: Evaluation of gel properties and wound healing. *Drug Dev. Ind. Pharm.* **40**, 852–859 (2014).
- 22. Tang, Y. *et al.* Honey loaded alginate/PVA nanofibrous membrane as potential bioactive wound dressing. *Carbohydr. Polym.* **219**, 113–120 (2019).
- 23. Xu, N. *et al.* Fabrication of Konjac glucomannan-based composite hydrogel crosslinked by calcium hydroxide for promising lacrimal plugging purpose. *Int. J. Biol. Macromol.* **127**, 440–449 (2019).
- 24. Bendtsen, S. T., Quinnell, S. P. & Wei, M. Development of a novel alginate-polyvinyl alcohol-hydroxyapatite hydrogel for 3D bioprinting bone tissue engineered scaffolds. *J. Biomed. Mater. Res. - Part A* **105**, 1457–1468 (2017).
- 25. Azarian, M. H., Boochathum, P. & Kongsema, M. Biocompatibility and biodegradability of filler encapsulated chloroacetated natural rubber/polyvinyl alcohol nanofiber for wound dressing. *Mater. Sci. Eng. C* **103**, 109829 (2019).
- 26. Costa, N. N. *et al.* Polymeric films containing pomegranate peel extract based on PVA/starch/PAA blends for use as wound dressing: In vitro analysis and physicochemical evaluation. *Mater. Sci. Eng. C* **109**, 110643 (2020).
- 27. Sharma, P. *et al.* Evaluation of physicochemical and biological properties of chitosan/poly (vinyl alcohol) polymer blend membranes and their correlation for Vero cell growth. *Carbohydr. Polym.* **137**, 576–583 (2016).
- 28. Das, A., Uppaluri, R. & Das, C. Compositional synergy of poly-vinyl alcohol, starch, glycerol and citric acid concentrations during wound dressing films fabrication. *Int. J. Biol. Macromol.* **146**, 70–79 (2020).
- 29. Das, A., Uppaluri, R. & Das, C. Feasibility of poly-vinyl alcohol/starch/glycerol/citric acid composite films for wound dressing applications. *Int. J. Biol. Macromol.* **131**, 998–1007 (2019).
- 30. Adeli, H., Khorasani, M. T. & Parvazinia, M. Wound dressing based on electrospun PVA/chitosan/starch nanofibrous mats: Fabrication, antibacterial and cytocompatibility evaluation and in vitro healing assay. *Int. J. Biol. Macromol.* **122**, 238–254 (2019).
- 31. Baghaie, S., Khorasani, M. T., Zarrabi, A. & Moshtaghian, J. Wound healing properties of PVA/starch/chitosan hydrogel membranes with nano Zinc oxide as antibacterial wound dressing material. *J. Biomater. Sci. Polym. Ed.* **28**, 2220–2241 (2017).
- 32. Kheradvar, S. A., Nourmohammadi, J., Tabesh, H. & Bagheri, B. Starch nanoparticle as a vitamin E-TPGS carrier loaded in silk fibroin-poly(vinyl alcohol)-Aloe vera nanofibrous dressing. *Colloids Surfaces B Biointerfaces* **166**, 9–16 (2018).
- 33. Islam, M. T. & Dafader, N. Studies on Swelling and Absorption Properties of theγ– Irradiated Polyvinyl Alcohol (PVA)/Kappa-Carrageenan Blend Hydrogels. *J. Adv. Chem. Eng.* **06**, 2–7 (2016).
- 34. Das, P. *et al.* Surface modification of electrospun PVA/chitosan nanofibers by dielectric barrier discharge plasma at atmospheric pressure and studies of their mechanical properties and biocompatibility. *Int. J. Biol. Macromol.* **114**, 1026–1032 (2018).
- 35. Alhosseini, S. N. *et al.* Synthesis and characterization of electrospun polyvinyl alcohol

nanofibrous scaffolds modified by blending with chitosan for neural tissue engineering. *Int. J. Nanomedicine* **7**, 25–34 (2012).

- 36. Garnica-Palafox, I. M. *et al.* Mechanical and structural response of a hybrid hydrogel based on chitosan and poly(vinyl alcohol) cross-linked with epichlorohydrin for potential use in tissue engineering. *J. Biomater. Sci. Polym. Ed.* **25**, 32–50 (2014).
- 37. Ghorbani, F., Pourhaghgouy, M., Mohammadi-hafshehjani, T. & Zamanian, A. Effect of Silane-Coupling Modification on the Performance of chitosan-poly vinyl Alcohol-Hybrid Scaffolds in Bone Tissue Engineering. *Silicon* (2020) doi:10.1007/s12633-020- 00397-2.
- 38. Chen, Q. *et al.* Electrospun chitosan/PVA/bioglass Nanofibrous membrane with spatially designed structure for accelerating chronic wound healing. *Mater. Sci. Eng. C* **105**, 110083 (2019).
- 39. Mallakpour, S. & Rashidimoghadam, S. *Preparation, characterization, and in vitro bioactivity study of glutaraldehyde crosslinked chitosan/poly(vinyl alcohol)/ascorbic acid-MWCNTs bionanocomposites*. *International Journal of Biological Macromolecules* vol. 144 (Elsevier B.V, 2020).
- 40. Januariyasa, I. K., Ana, I. D. & Yusuf, Y. Nanofibrous poly(vinyl alcohol)/chitosan contained carbonated hydroxyapatite nanoparticles scaffold for bone tissue engineering. *Mater. Sci. Eng. C* **107**, 110347 (2020).
- 41. Garnica-Palafox, I. M. *et al.* Influence of multi-walled carbon nanotubes on the physico-chemical and biological responses of chitosan-based hybrid hydrogels. *Carbohydr. Polym.* **236**, 115971 (2020).
- 42. Ibrahim, S. *et al.* Improved genistein loading and release on electrospun chitosan nanofiber blends. *J. Mol. Liq.* **223**, 1056–1061 (2016).
- 43. Nie, L. *et al.* Hydroxyethyl Chitosan-Reinforced Polyvinyl Alcohol/Biphasic Calcium

Phosphate Hydrogels for Bone Regeneration. *ACS Omega* **5**, 10948–10957 (2020).

- 44. Thongtham, N., Chai-in, P., Unger, O., Boonrungsiman, S. & Suwantong, O. Fabrication of chitosan/collagen/hydroxyapatite scaffolds with encapsulated Cissus quadrangularis extract. *Polym. Adv. Technol.* **31**, 1496–1507 (2020).
- 45. Yang, W. *et al.* Antioxidant and antibacterial lignin nanoparticles in polyvinyl alcohol/chitosan films for active packaging. *Ind. Crops Prod.* **94**, 800–811 (2016).
- 46. Najafiasl, M., Osfouri, S., Azin, R. & Zaeri, S. Alginate-based electrospun core/shell nanofibers containing dexpanthenol: A good candidate for wound dressing. *J. Drug Deliv. Sci. Technol.* **57**, 101708 (2020).
- 47. Ceylan, S., Göktürk, D., Demir, D., Damla Özdemir, M. & Bölgen, N. Comparison of additive effects on the PVA/starch cryogels: Synthesis, characterization, cytotoxicity, and genotoxicity studies. *Int. J. Polym. Mater. Polym. Biomater.* **67**, 855–864 (2018).
- 48. Pon-On, W. *et al.* Mechanical properties, biological activity and protein controlled release by poly(vinyl alcohol)-bioglass/chitosan-collagen composite scaffolds: A bone tissue engineering applications. *Mater. Sci. Eng. C* **38**, 63–72 (2014).
- 49. Cao, L., Zhang, F., Wang, Q. & Wu, X. Fabrication of chitosan/graphene oxide polymer nanofiber and its biocompatibility for cartilage tissue engineering. *Mater. Sci. Eng. C* **79**, 697–701 (2017).
- 50. Amin, M. A. & Abdel-Raheem, I. T. Accelerated wound healing and antiinflammatory effects of physically cross linked polyvinyl alcohol-chitosan hydrogel containing honey bee venom in diabetic rats. *Arch. Pharm. Res.* **37**, 1016–1031 (2014).
- 51. Hajji, S. *et al.* Biomedical potential of chitosan-silver nanoparticles with special reference to antioxidant, antibacterial, hemolytic and in vivo cutaneous wound healing effects. *Biochim. Biophys. Acta - Gen. Subj.* **1863**, 241–254 (2019).
- 52. Yar, M. *et al.* Heparin binding chitosan derivatives for production of pro-angiogenic hydrogels for promoting tissue healing. *Mater. Sci. Eng. C* **74**, 347–356 (2017).
- 53. Shokrgozar, M. A., Mottaghitalab, F., Mottaghitalab, V. & Farokhi, M. Fabrication of porous chitosan/poly(vinyl alcohol) reinforced single-walled carbon nanotube nanocomposites for neural tissue engineering. *J. Biomed. Nanotechnol.* **7**, 276–284 (2011).
- 54. R., N. *et al.* Enhanced wound healing by PVA/Chitosan/Curcumin patches: In vitro and in vivo study. *Colloids Surfaces B Biointerfaces* **182**, (2019).
- 55. Zahid, A. A., Ahmed, R., Ur Rehman, S. R., Augustine, R. & Hasan, A. Reactive Nitrogen Species Releasing Hydrogel for Enhanced Wound Healing. *Proc. Annu. Int. Conf. IEEE Eng. Med. Biol. Soc. EMBS* 3939–3942 (2019) doi:10.1109/EMBC.2019.8856469.
- 56. Peng, L. *et al.* Characterization of a novel polyvinyl alcohol/chitosan porous hydrogel combined with bone marrow mesenchymal stem cells and its application in articular cartilage repair. *BMC Musculoskelet. Disord.* **20**, 1–12 (2019).
- 57. Jaikumar, D. *et al.* Injectable alginate-O-carboxymethyl chitosan/nano fibrin composite hydrogels for adipose tissue engineering. *Int. J. Biol. Macromol.* **74**, 318– 326 (2015).
- 58. Shao, C. *et al.* Mimicking Dynamic Adhesiveness and Strain-Stiffening Behavior of Biological Tissues in Tough and Self-Healable Cellulose Nanocomposite Hydrogels. *ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces* **11**, 5885–5895 (2019).
- 59. Shah, N., Ul-Islam, M., Khattak, W. A. & Park, J. K. Overview of bacterial cellulose composites: A multipurpose advanced material. *Carbohydr. Polym.* **98**, 1585–1598 (2013).
- 60. Chalal, S., Hussain, F. S. J. & Yusoff, M. B. M. Biomimetic growth of bone-like

apatite via simulated body fluid on hydroxyethyl cellulose/polyvinyl alcohol electrospun nanofibers. *Biomed. Mater. Eng.* **24**, 799–806 (2014).

- 61. Zhang, Y. *et al.* RSC Advances stability and cell adhesive ability. *RSC Adv.* **5**, 78180– 78191 (2015).
- 62. Sapru, S., Das, S., Mandal, M., Ghosh, A. K. & Kundu, S. C. Prospects of nonmulberry silk protein sericin-based nanofibrous matrices for wound healing – In vitro and in vivo investigations. *Acta Biomater.* **78**, 137–150 (2018).
- 63. Golchin, A. *et al.* Biological behavior of the curcumin incorporated chitosan/poly(vinyl alcohol) nanofibers for biomedical applications. *J. Cell. Biochem.* **120**, 15410–15421 (2019).
- 64. Gholipour-Kanani, A. *et al.* Tissue engineered poly(caprolactone)-chitosan-poly (vinyl alcohol) nanofibrous scaffolds for burn and cutting wound healing. *IET Nanobiotechnology* **8**, 123–131 (2014).
- 65. Zhang, H., Zhang, F. & Wu, J. Physically crosslinked hydrogels from polysaccharides prepared by freeze-thaw technique. *React. Funct. Polym.* **73**, 923–928 (2013).
- 66. Ergul, N. M. *et al.* 3D printing of chitosan/ poly(vinyl alcohol) hydrogel containing synthesized hydroxyapatite scaffolds for hard-tissue engineering. *Polym. Test.* **79**, 106006 (2019).
- 67. Kadhim, I. A., Abdul Ameer, Z. J. & Alzubaidi, A. B. Investigation of Chitosan Film Degradation in Tissue Engineering Applications. *IOP Conf. Ser. Mater. Sci. Eng.* **671**, (2020).
- 68. Tummala, G. K., Joffre, T., Rojas, R., Persson, C. & Mihranyan, A. Strain-induced stiffening of nanocellulosereinforced poly(vinyl alcohol) hydrogels mimicking collagenous soft tissues. *Soft Matter* **13**, 3936–3945 (2017).
- 69. Bi, S. *et al.* Construction of physical-crosslink chitosan/PVA double-network hydrogel

with surface mineralization for bone repair. *Carbohydr. Polym.* **224**, 115176 (2019).

- 70. Abbas, M. *et al.* Wound healing potential of curcumin cross-linked chitosan/polyvinyl alcohol. *Int. J. Biol. Macromol.* **140**, 871–876 (2019).
- 71. Ho, Y.-C., Huang, F.-M. & Chang, Y.-C. Biodegradable Polymer–Silica Xerogel Composite Microspheres for Controlled Release of Gentamicin. *J. Biomed. Mater. Res. B. Appl. Biomater.* **83**, 340–344 (2005).
- 72. Pangon, A., Saesoo, S., Saengkrit, N., Ruktanonchai, U. & Intasanta, V. Hydroxyapatite-hybridized chitosan/chitin whisker bionanocomposite fibers for bone tissue engineering applications. *Carbohydr. Polym.* **144**, 419–427 (2016).
- 73. Pandit, J., Sultana, Y. & Aqil, M. Chitosan-coated PLGA nanoparticles of bevacizumab as novel drug delivery to target retina: optimization, characterization, and in vitro toxicity evaluation. *Artif. Cells, Nanomedicine Biotechnol.* **45**, 1397–1407 (2017).
- 74. Marín, J. A. T. *et al.* Biocompatible and antimicrobial electrospun membranes based on nanocomposites of chitosan/poly (Vinyl alcohol)/graphene oxide. *Int. J. Mol. Sci.* **20**, (2019).
- 75. Boukari, Y. *et al.* A dual-application poly (dl-lactic-co-glycolic) acid (PLGA)-chitosan composite scaffold for potential use in bone tissue engineering. *J. Biomater. Sci. Polym. Ed.* **28**, 1966–1983 (2017).
- 76. George, L., Bavya, M. C., Rohan, K. V. & Srivastava, R. A therapeutic polyelectrolyte–vitamin C nanoparticulate system in polyvinyl alcohol–alginate hydrogel: An approach to treat skin and soft tissue infections caused by Staphylococcus aureus. *Colloids Surfaces B Biointerfaces* **160**, 315–324 (2017).
- 77. Figueroa-Pizano, M. D., Vélaz, I. & Martínez-Barbosa, M. E. A freeze-thawing method to prepare chitosan-poly(Vinyl alcohol) hydrogels without crosslinking agents

and diflunisal release studies. *J. Vis. Exp.* **2020**, 1–9 (2019).

- 78. Laschke, M. W. & Menger, M. D. Prevascularization in tissue engineering: Current concepts and future directions. *Biotechnol. Adv.* **34**, 112–121 (2016).
- 79. Koosha, M., Raoufi, M. & Moravvej, H. One-pot reactive electrospinning of chitosan/PVA hydrogel nanofibers reinforced by halloysite nanotubes with enhanced fibroblast cell attachment for skin tissue regeneration. *Colloids Surfaces B Biointerfaces* **179**, 270–279 (2019).
- 80. Kaur, P., Gondil, V. S. & Chhibber, S. A novel wound dressing consisting of PVA-SA hybrid hydrogel membrane for topical delivery of bacteriophages and antibiotics. *Int. J. Pharm.* **572**, 118779 (2019).
- 81. Kheradmandi, M., Vasheghani-Farahani, E., Ghiaseddin, A. & Ganji, F. Skeletal muscle regeneration via engineered tissue culture over electrospun nanofibrous chitosan/PVA scaffold. *J. Biomed. Mater. Res. - Part A* **104**, 1720–1727 (2016).
- 82. Bichara, D. A. *et al.* Porous poly(vinyl alcohol)-alginate gel hybrid construct for neocartilage formation using human nasoseptal cells. *J. Surg. Res.* **163**, 331–336 (2010).
- 83. Zhang, H. *et al.* Direct 3D Printed Biomimetic Scaffolds Based on Hydrogel Microparticles for Cell Spheroid Growth. *Adv. Funct. Mater.* **30**, 1–10 (2020).
- 84. Ruiz, S. *et al.* Antimicrobial films based on nanocomposites of chitosan/poly(Vinyl alcohol)/graphene oxide for biomedical applications. *Biomolecules* **9**, 1–17 (2019).
- 85. Janković, B., Pelipenko, J., Škarabot, M., Muševič, I. & Kristl, J. The design trend in tissue-engineering scaffolds based on nanomechanical properties of individual electrospun nanofibers. *Int. J. Pharm.* **455**, 338–347 (2013).
- 86. Covelo, A., Gómez, K. K., Corona-Lira, P., Ramírez-Reivich, A. C. & Hernández, M. Electrochemical characterization of PVA/SA nanofibers obtained by electrospinning

processing. in *Surface and Interface Analysis* vol. 50 1012–1017 (2018).

- 87. Rafique, A., Mahmood Zia, K., Zuber, M., Tabasum, S. & Rehman, S. Chitosan functionalized poly(vinyl alcohol) for prospects biomedical and industrial applications: A review. *Int. J. Biol. Macromol.* **87**, 141–154 (2016).
- 88. Milkoreit et al., 2018. Ac ce pte d M us pt. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **in press**, 0–31 (2017).
- 89. Duque Sánchez, L. M., Rodriguez, L. & López, M. Electrospinning: The Nanofibers Age. *Rev. Iberoam. Polímeros Vol. Iber. Polímeros* **14**, 10–27 (2014).
- 90. Gaaz, T. S. *et al.* Properties and applications of polyvinyl alcohol, halloysite nanotubes and their nanocomposites. *Molecules* **20**, 22833–22847 (2015).
- 91. You, Y., Park, W. H., Ko, B. M. & Min, B. M. Effects of PVA sponge containing chitooligosaccharide in the early stage of wound healing. *J. Mater. Sci. Mater. Med.* **15**, 297–301 (2004).
- 92. Tovar, C. D. G. *et al.* Nanocomposite films of chitosan-grafted carbon nano-onions for biomedical applications. *Molecules* **25**, 1–26 (2020).

# **ANNEX A: COMPARATIVE TABLE BETWEEN DIFFERENT PARAMETERS USE IN THE PUBLICATIONS TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT**



































